New Exporter Dynamics (2017, IER)

Kim J. Ruhl and Jonathan L. Willis

Presented by Heejin Yoon

October 26, 2022

Motivation

- The static trade model and standard sunk-cost model
 - Replicates the key features of the exporters
 - ▶ e.g., low participation rate, exporter size premium, low entry & exit rates, aggregate impact of policy
- How about the dynamics of "new" exporters?
 - Can sunk-cost models reproduce the key dynamics of new exporters?
- In the data, new exporters..
 - 1. begin small gradually expand their export volumes (Figure 1a)
 - 2. are more likely to exit the export market (Figure 1b)



Figure 1: New Exporter Dynamics

Model: Standard Sunk-Cost Model

Environment

• CES preferncce:
$$U(c) = C = \left(\sum_{j=1}^{J} c_{j}^{\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}}\right)^{\frac{\theta}{\theta-1}}$$

- $\blacktriangleright \text{ Production: } f(\tilde{e}_j, n_j, k_j) = \tilde{e}_j n_j^{\alpha_N} k_j^{\alpha_K}, \qquad \tilde{e}_j \sim \mathsf{AR}(1)$
- Entry and maintaining costs to export $(f_0 \text{ and } f_1)$

Profit:
$$\Pi_j = \frac{p_j}{P} y_j + I(\underbrace{X'_j}_{\text{current export status}} = 1) \times \underbrace{Q}_{\text{real exchange rate}} \times \frac{p_j^*}{P^*} y_j^* - wn_j - rk_j, \quad Q \sim AR(1)$$

Static and dynamic decision problem of plants

► (Static problem) Given X'_j , the optimal amount $(y_j, y_j^*) = \left(\frac{Q^{-\theta} \frac{C}{C^*}}{1+Q^{-\theta} \frac{C}{C^*}} \tilde{e}_j n_j^{\alpha_N} k_j^{\alpha_K}, \frac{1}{1+Q^{-\theta} \frac{C}{C^*}} \tilde{e}_j n_j^{\alpha_N} k_j^{\alpha_K}\right)$

(Dynamic problem)

$$V(X_{j}, \epsilon_{j}, Q) = \max_{X'_{j}} \left[\Pi(X'_{j}, \epsilon_{j}, Q) - f_{X}(X_{j}, X'_{j}) + R\mathbb{E}_{\epsilon'_{j}, Q'}V(X'_{j}, \epsilon'_{j}, Q') \right]$$

$$\Rightarrow X'_{j}(0, \epsilon_{j}, Q) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if} \quad \Pi(1, \epsilon_{j}, Q) + R\mathbb{E}_{\epsilon'_{j}, Q'} \left[V(1, \epsilon'_{j}, Q') - V(0, \epsilon'_{j}, Q') \right] - f_{0} \ge 0 \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Model: Extended Model with Two Modifications

- 1. Gradual foreign demand
 - Plant j that has been an exporter for a periods faces the following demand:

$$c_j^*(a) = \gamma(a) \left(\frac{p_j^*(a)}{P^*}\right)^{-\theta} C^*$$
$$\gamma(a) = \begin{cases} \gamma_0 + \gamma_1 a & \text{if } a = 0, \cdots, 21\\ 1 & \text{if } a > 21 \end{cases}$$

2. Stochastic entry cost

▶ With probability $1 - \zeta_L$, $f_0 = f_H$, and with probability ζ_L , $f_0 = f_L = 0$

Estimation & Results

• Fit $\phi = (f_0, f_1, C^*, \rho_{\epsilon}, \sigma_{\epsilon})$ using 5 moments from the data:

Starter rate, stopper rate, average export-sales ratio, the coefficient of variation of plant size, and AR(1) coefficient of domestic sales

	f ₀	f_1	C*	σ_{ϵ}	ρ_{ϵ}	γ_0	γ_1	ξL
Standard Sunk-Cost	0.961	0.047	0.146	0.116	0.873			
Gradual Demand	0.286	0.064	0.198	0.116	0.873	0.258	0.024	
Gradual Demand & Stochastic Entry	0.590	0.057	0.185	0.116	0.873	0.278	0.026	0.009

Table 1: Estimated Parameter Values

Figure 2: The Sunk-Cost Model and the Extended Model



Mechanism & Aggregate Implication

- Mechanism
 - In the extended model, the cumulative profit grows slowly (22 quarters till break even)
 - It takes only 7 quarters in the standard sunk-cost model
 - The standard model front-loads the profits from exporting



Figure 3: Average Export Profit of Export Entrants

- Aggregate Implications: larger response in the extended model
 - Temporary shock: one-standard deviation increase in the real exchange rate
 - Permanent shock: 4% rise in foreign demand

Discussion

- Summary
 - New exporter dynamics: slow growth & greater exit rate
 - The standard sunk-cost model fails to account for the dynamics in the data
 - The estimated entry cost is exaggerated
 - With two modifications, the entrant's behavior of the model matches the data
- Discussion
 - Partial equilibrium
 - Simple (is best)
 - \blacktriangleright Wage, interest rate, price level is fixed \Rightarrow limit the welfare and aggregate implications
 - The extensions are not justified
 - Overall acceptable, but temporary exit initialize the foreign demand function, $\gamma(a)$?
 - Exporter size premium may become smaller: why not targeted?
- Possible applications
 - S-shaped gamma function, stochastic process of entry cost
 - Application to the mortgage lenders

Thank You!

Appendix: The Model Description Details

- > The decisions that plants make in response to changes in relative prices and productivity
- Abstract from general equilibrium effects by assuming a constant wage, interest rate, and domestic price level.

Demand

A representative agent in the domestic economy

- Supplies labor inelastically.
- Preferences over an aggregate consumption good, C.

$$U = C = \left(\sum_{j=1}^{J} c_{j}^{\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}}\right)^{\frac{\theta}{\theta-1}}.$$
 (1)

where θ is the elasticity of substitution b/w varieties and J is the number of varieties.

Budget constraint:

$$\sum_{j=1}^{J} c_j p_j = I.$$
⁽²⁾

where I is the consumer's income.

Demand

(ctd.)

Then, the representative agent's demand for variety j is:

$$c_j = (p_j / P)^{-\theta} C, \qquad (3)$$

where P is the price of a unit of aggregate consumption,

$$P = \left(\sum_{j=1}^{J} p_j^{1-\theta}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}}.$$
(4)

The rest of the world: a representative consumer with an analogous utility function and budget constraint.

Foreign demand for variety *j*:

$$c_j^* = (p_j^* / P^*)^{-\theta} C^*,$$
(5)

The Plant's Static Problem

Monopolistic competition environment.

▶ Plant *j* chooses productions for the domestic market, y_j , and the export market, y_i^* .

Production function:

$$f(\tilde{\epsilon}_j, n_j, k_j) = \tilde{\epsilon}_j n_j^{\alpha_N} k_j^{\alpha_K}.$$
(6)

The plant chooses prices, production, input demand, and export status.

$$\Pi_{j} = \frac{p_{j}}{P} y_{j} + I(\underbrace{X'_{j}}_{\text{export status}} = 1) Q \frac{p_{j}^{*}}{P^{*}} y_{j}^{*} - wn_{j} - rk_{j}.$$

$$\tag{7}$$

The plant's static maximization problem:

$$\Pi_{j}(X'_{j},\epsilon_{j},Q) = \max_{y_{j},y_{j}^{*}} \left[C^{\frac{1}{\theta}} y_{j}^{\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}} + I(X'_{j}=1) Q C^{*\frac{1}{\theta}} y_{j}^{*\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}} - wn_{j} - rk_{j} \right]$$
s.t. $y_{j} + y_{j}^{*} = \tilde{\epsilon_{j}} n_{j}^{\alpha_{N}} k_{j}^{\alpha_{K}}, \ (\alpha_{N} + \alpha_{K} \leq 1).$
(8)

The Plant's Static Problem (ctd.)

▶ The optimal quantities shipped domestically and abroad:

$$y_{j} = \frac{Q^{-\theta} \frac{C}{C^{*}}}{1 + Q^{-\theta} \frac{C}{C^{*}}} \tilde{\epsilon}_{j} n_{j}^{\alpha_{N}} k_{j}^{\alpha_{K}}, \qquad (9)$$
$$y_{j}^{*} = \frac{1}{1 + Q^{-\theta} \frac{C}{C^{*}}} \tilde{\epsilon}_{j} n_{j}^{\alpha_{N}} k_{j}^{\alpha_{K}}.$$

• The maximized profit given X'_j , ϵ_j , and Q ($\epsilon_j = \tilde{\epsilon}^{\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}}$):

$$\Pi(X'_{j},\epsilon_{j},Q) \equiv \max_{n_{j},k_{j}} \left[1 + I(X'_{j}=1)Q^{\theta}\frac{C^{*}}{C} \right]^{\frac{1}{\theta}} C^{\frac{1}{\theta}}\epsilon_{j}n_{j}^{\alpha_{N}\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}}k_{j}^{\alpha_{K}\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}} - wn_{j} - rk_{j}.$$
(10)

The Plant's Dynamic Problem

▶ There are entering (f_0) and maintaining costs f_1 to export $(f_0 - f_1)$: sunk entry cost).

$$f_X(X_j, X'_j) = f_0 I(X'_j = 1 | X_j = 0) + f_1 I(X'_j = 1 | X_j = 1).$$
(11)

• The Q and ϵ_j are assumed to follow AR(1) processes

$$\ln \epsilon_t = \rho_\epsilon \ln \epsilon_{t-1} + \omega_{\epsilon,t}, \quad \omega_{\epsilon,t} \sim (N, \sigma_\epsilon^2)$$
(12)

$$\ln Q_t = \rho_Q \ln Q_{t-1} + \omega_{Q,t}, \quad \omega_{Q,t} \sim (N, \sigma_Q^2).$$
(13)

► A plant's dynamic decision problem is given by:

$$V(X_j,\epsilon_j,Q) = \max_{X'_j} \left[\Pi(X'_j,\epsilon_j,Q) - f_X(X_j,X'_j) + R\mathbb{E}_{\epsilon'_j,Q'}V(X'_j,\epsilon'_j,Q') \right].$$
(14)

The Plant's Dynamic Problem (ctd.)

Policy function for export entry decision:

$$X_{j}^{\prime}(0,\epsilon_{j},Q) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if} \quad \Pi(1,\epsilon_{j},Q) + R\mathbb{E}_{\epsilon_{j}^{\prime},Q^{\prime}} \bigg[V(1,\epsilon_{j}^{\prime},Q^{\prime}) - V(0,\epsilon_{j}^{\prime},Q^{\prime}) \bigg] - f_{0} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$
(15)

Gradual Demand: Setting

Plant j that has been an exporter for a periods faces the demand curve:

$$c_{j}^{*}(a) = \gamma(a) \left(\frac{p_{j}^{*}(a)}{P^{*}}\right)^{-\theta} C^{*}$$

$$\gamma(a) = \begin{cases} \gamma_{0} + \gamma_{1} a & \text{if } a = 0, \cdots, 21 \\ 1 & \text{if } a > 21 \end{cases}$$
(16)
(17)

Demand function leads a new exporter to slowly increase its exports.

• In the estimation, γ_0 and γ_1 are estimated by adding moments.

• i.e., the coefficients of the regression of
$$\frac{ex_a}{sales_a}$$
 on a.

Gradual Demand: Results

- As in the data, a plant's export profits are pushed out into the future.
 - It lowers the present value of export entry.
 - f_0 now falls to 29% of the median plant's sales.
- ▶ The gradual demand model still cannot account for the pattern of new exporter survival.

Figure 2. The Sunk-Cost Model and the Gradual Demand Model



Gradual Demand and Stochastic Entry Costs (Extended Model)

- To generate a low survival rate for new exporters, the model needs to allow for some "bad" plants to enter the export market:
 - With probability $1 \zeta_L$, $f_0 = f_H$, and with probability ζ_L , $f_0 = 0$.
- \triangleright ζ_L is estimated by further including the initial survival rate in the moment vector.

The extended model captures the conditional survivor rate dynamics.

Figure 3. The Sunk-Cost Model and the Extended Model



Gradual Demand and Stochastic Entry Costs (Extended Model) (ctd.)

- In the extended model, the plant's cumulative profit grows slowly and it takes 22 quarters to break even.
 - It takes only 7 quarters in the sunk-cost model.
 - The standard model front-loads the profits from exporting.

Figure 4. Average Export Profit of Export Entrants

